Scenario: The Annual Merit Boards

Group Size: 4-15

This scenario may contain explicit language and references to harmful situations which may be emotionally activating for some people. If you need support, services are available through the CAF Member Assistance Program (CFMAP) and the Employee Assistance Program (EAP).

Warrant Officer (WO) Paula Detton has been anxiously waiting for her supervisor, Major (Maj) Sam Pinkus, to approach her and schedule a meeting to talk about the upcoming formation-level ranking boards. With history as a guide, the WO knows that each year at this time the Major will ask her to reflect on her activities over the past year and provide him with information about her activities and accomplishments, in effect, provide what is commonly referred to as a 'brag sheet'.

In theory, once Maj Pinkus has received WO Detton's brag sheet, he will be able to speak knowingly and confidently at the Unit Merit Board about WO Detton's demonstrated performance in the previous 12 months and her potential for moving up in rank. Importantly, the information to complete the internal unit scoring matrix, which will rank WO Detton and position her amongst her peers.

The unit scoring matrix is a complex document which supervisors use to score their subordinates on a variety of critical competencies. In addition, professional development information, such as language profile, and academic and military course completion is also required. As WO Detton knows, substantial justification is required to achieve high scores at the Merit Board.

With the Merit Board only a week away, WO Detton, unable to wait any longer, approaches Maj Pinkus and asks if he needs any information from her to prepare her file for the Board. With some embarrassment, Maj Pinkus acknowledges that he had completely forgotten about the Board.

He ponders this for a moment, moves to the computer and pulls up the unit scoring matrix.

"You've accomplished a great deal this year, I'd be doing you a disservice if I didn't ensure that this matrix was filled out to your maximal advantage," he says. "I'll tell you what, I'll email it to you, and you complete it for me. Make sure you score yourself high in the leadership sections, we want to get you promoted."

"Yes Sir, I'll start right away," says WO Detton automatically. As she leaves Maj Pinkus' office, she can't help reflecting on the adage, "you're your own best career manager" and thinking that she really isn't sure that this was how it was meant to be applied.

Categories

Principles:	Respect the Dignity of all Persons, Obey and Support Lawful Authority
Values:	Integrity, Loyalty, Courage, Stewardship, Excellence
Cultural Themes:	Service, Identity, Leadership
Misconduct Types:	Not Specific
GBA Plus Themes:	Not Specific
Audience:	Canadian Armed Forces

Facilitator's Guide

Learning Objectives:

- Discuss the ethical principle of "Obey and Support Lawful Authority", and "Respect the Dignity of all Persons" in this setting.
- Discuss the ethical values of stewardship, integrity, loyalty, and courage in this setting.

Facilitation Questions:

1. What would you do in this situation? What are the considerations?
    - Allow open discussion from the group.
    - Ethical concerns: Is Maj Pinkus compromising ethical values? If WO Detton does fill out her own scoring matrix, are they implicated in the compromising of ethical values?
    - Personal factors: Is this an opportunity for WO Detton's to promote their own career goals by highlighting their achievements? Would promoting their achievements, at the risk of compromising themself impact their loyalty to their commanding officer?
2. What is the ethical dilemma in this situation?
    - Would WO Detton filling out their own ranking in this scenario compromise their integrity?
    - If they refuse to do so, would it negatively impact their career repercussions or create an atmosphere or resentment?
3. What are some potential courses of action that could be taken in this scenario?
    - Option 1: WO Detton could explain to Maj Pinkus they are uncomfortable with the request and would prefer to not fill out their own scoring matrix. WO Detton might suggest that they could provide a list of their accomplishments to facilitate the process.
    - Option 2: WO Detton could consult with someone else in the chain of command for advice but may risk escalating the issue if the situation gets reported.
    - Option 3: Report Maj Pinkus for violating relevant regulations by asking them to complete their own scoring matrix.